The Evaluation of Career Center Management at Health Colleges: A CIPP Model Approach

Putu Gede Subhaktiyasa¹,², I Gede Ratnaya², Muhamad Nazim³, Bayangkari⁴, Made Ani Suprapta⁵

STIKES Wira Medika Bali, Indonesia¹
Universitas Pendidikan Ganesha, Indonesia²
Dinas Pendidikan Lombok Tengah, Indonesia³,⁴
Rumah Sakit Umum Pusat Sanglah Denpasar, Indonesia⁵

E-mail: pgs@stikeswiramedika.ac.id¹, gede.ratnaya@undiksha.ac.id², samarcathon@gmail.com³, sahipbayangkari@gmail.com⁴, anikaju05@gmail.com⁵

Abstract

The career center is one solution in responding to the high unemployment rate with higher education which is possible due to a mismatch between educational competence and the need for employment, or an imbalance between demand and supply. The purpose of this study was to determine the success and effectiveness of the implementation of the career center program at one of the universities in the health sector in Denpasar City. This study is an evaluation study using the CIPP model which was analyzed qualitatively. The results show that in the context aspect it is necessary to set a clear vision, mission, and goals. The input aspect shows that there is no curriculum as a guide and the implementation of several programs has not been optimally assessed from the process aspect. Meanwhile, the product aspect shows good acceptance of graduates in the world of work. It is hoped that the career center program can be improved by implementing strategic management and providing entrepreneurship education.

Keywords: program evaluation, career center, CIPP model

Corresponding author:
Email : pgs@stikeswiramedika.ac.id
DOI : https://doi.org/10.31004/basicedu.v6i5.3707

ISSN 2580-3735 (Media Cetak)
ISSN 2580-1147 (Media Online)
INTRODUCTION

Indonesia is faced with a high level of educated unemployment. The National Labor Force Survey in 2021 shows the number of educated unemployed (diploma and undergraduate) reaching 11.85%, while the number of uneducated unemployed is only 3.61%. When viewed in the previous year, the trend of data from the 1986–2020 National Labor Force Survey shows results that are not much different (BPS, 2021). This is a challenge considering the number of educated graduates is also increasing yearly. The number of university graduates in Indonesia in 2019 was 1,756,239 (Kemenristekdikti, 2019), increasing to 2,163,681 in 2020 (Kemendikbud, 2020).

The high unemployment rate in higher education is possible due to a mismatch between educational competence and job requirements, an imbalance between demand and supply, and the quality of graduates produced (Direktorat Jenderal Pendidikan Tinggi, 2012). This condition, of course, also has a negative impact, especially on educational institutions. Public confidence in education investment will decrease. The concept of education as an investment has placed humans as the primary focus (Schultz, 1961), which is correlated with economic growth (Widiansyah, 2017; Guo, Huang & Zhang, 2019; Hanushek & Woessmann, 2020). This shows the importance of universities in providing competency-based education to ensure employability or graduate careers (Abdullah, Abd Majid, and Hussin, 2022).

Competency-based education is essential in responding to challenges in the era of globalization. Global competition with advances in information technology in the era of revolution 4.0 and the era of society 5.0 requires education that can shape and produce creative, innovative, and competitive generations (Kahar et al., 2020, Sasikirana, Vania Herlambang, 2020). For this reason, the Government, through the Ministry of Education and Culture, encourages every university in Indonesia to form a career center as a solution to increase competence and reduce gaps that occur (Direktorat Jenderal Pendidikan Tinggi, 2012).

Career centers become institutions within the higher education structure to help graduates acquire specific skills according to the job market’s needs. The career center guides career planning. This strategic approach starts with a career choice early on and needs to be developed throughout the educational process (Wei et al., 2021). A career center is essential in directing life goals and providing productive impetus for national economic growth (Hughes et al., 2002). A career is a lifelong process that develops from birth to death (Andersen and Vandehey, 2011).

Awareness of the importance of the existence of a career center is not yet comprehensive. Many universities still do not have a career center in their structure. However, policies related to integrating career centers with accreditation of study programs and institutions (BAN-PT, 2019) have grown career centers in universities. Although the form, structure, type of activity, and intensity are graded according to the situation and condition of Higher Education due to the disparity and heterogeneity of Higher Education in Indonesia (Direktorat Jenderal Pendidikan Tinggi, 2012). Of course, this poses challenges related to implementing career centers in universities.

Several studies have been conducted regarding the development of higher education career centers in Indonesia (Fitriani, 2016; Afrida and Iskandar, 2017; Gat, 2018), but no research has been found that examines the overall evaluation of the implementation of career center management. So it becomes essential to be analyzed further related to the career center program. The research was conducted at a career center of the health sector universities in Denpasar city. The primary reason is that this university produces graduates as professional health workers. Not only completing the educational process but they are required to pass the national competency test for health workers to be declared competent health workers, as confirmed in Law No. 36 of 2014 (UU RI No 36 Tahun 2014). Passing the competency test is an acknowledgment of the competence possessed by health workers in carrying out their profession by measuring knowledge, skills, and attitudes following professional standards. So it is exciting to see his achievement in the world of work.
This study aims to determine the success and effectiveness of implementing the career center program at one of the universities in the health sector in Denpasar City. The evaluation is carried out using the CIPP approach to analyze context, input, process, and product that affect the number and quality of graduations to obtain suitability of competence and acceptance in the world of work. CIPP is a comprehensive evaluation model to evaluate a program, personal, product, institution, and system (Stufflebeam, Madam, and Kellaghan, 2000; Stufflebeam, 2015). This model is oriented to management (management-oriented evaluation approach) with the aim of the evaluation is to improve (to improve), not as proof (Madaus, George F. Michael S. Scriven, dan Daniel L. Stufflebeam, 1983; Owen, John M, 1993 in Mahmudi, 2011). Through the evaluation of the implementation of this program, it is hoped that it can provide recommendations for improving the career center program.

RESEARCH METHODS

This type of research is evaluation research with a Context, Input, Process, and Product, abbreviated as CIPP. The CIPP Evaluation Model is applied comprehensively to understand program planning until its completion (Stufflebeam, 2015) so that the results can be considered in making decisions on program improvement. Core Concepts of the CIPP model based on four parts will refer to the question, What to do? How to do it? Was it done? Did it work? Retrospectively, the four sections ask, Did the program have clear goals based on needs? Were the targeted needs addressed by a sound, responsive plan? Was the program’s plan effectively implemented? Did the program succeed? (Stufflebeam, 2015).

The method used is a qualitative research method. The qualitative research method is based on the philosophy of postpositivism. It's used to examine the condition of natural objects, where the researcher is the key instrument, the data collection technique is carried out by triangulation, and the results of qualitative research emphasize meaning rather than generalization (Sugiono, 2013; Creswell, 2013; Creswell and Creswell, 2018).

The research was conducted at a career center at a health university in the city of Denpasar, which was recorded on the official tracer study of the Ministry of Education and Culture's career center. There is one university in the field of health in Denpasar City which reports the existence of a career center on that page, so it was chosen to be the place of research. Data collection is based on the CIPP evaluation model through interviews, observations, and triangulation of documentation.

Informants in this study were Career Center Managers, Tutors, Students, Alumni, and the Human Resource Development (HRD) department at health service facilities in Denpasar City where graduates work. Evaluation is viewed from the aspect of Context, Input, Process, and Product. Aspects of Context are evaluated on the background, policies, vision, mission, and goals of the career center program. Input aspects are evaluated on Management, Curriculum, Tutors, Students, Facilities, and Infrastructure. In the process aspect, monitoring of sources that have the potential to cause failure is carried out. Evaluation is carried out on the program schedule and implementation. Furthermore, the product aspect that is evaluated is the achievement of the career center program. At the same time, the data analysis technique uses the Analysis Interactive Model: data collection, data reduction, data display, and conclusions (Sugiono, 2013; Miles, Huberman, and Saldañna, 2014).

RESULTS AND DISCUSSION

The study results are presented using the CIPP Evaluation Model approach developed by Stufflebeam. This model will review the Context, Input, Process, and Product of implementing a career center at one of the universities in the health sector in Denpasar City.
Context Aspect

The career center at this university was officially established in 2018 based on the Chairman's Decree. The primary role of the career center is to be a unit that provides support in the form of academic programs and experiential learning to encourage students to learn and develop themselves. In this context, the primary purpose of career services is to assist students in being able to build, evaluate, and or implement careers and education and make decisions about the plan or career they will choose. Career center goals demonstrate clarity and measurable results. This will undoubtedly prevent the spread of organizational energy, focus on completing tasks and be able to improve performance (Kholis, 2014). The existence of goals is not followed by a statement of the vision and mission of the career center. The vision, mission, and goals are essential in strategy formulation (Mahmudi, 2007) in Kholis (2014). The career center vision only refers to the university's vision of a professional and competitive health education center at the national level in 2020 and globally by 2030.

Previously, programs carried out as career center tasks were carried out by different units within the Higher Education structure. However, all these programs are currently implemented centrally by the career center. The functions of the career center are 1) Career Counseling and Career Counseling and Services), 2) Career information and Employment services, 3) Potential and competency mapping services for students or graduates (Tracer Study and User Satisfaction Survey), and 4) Experiential learning through job preparation training, internship program, and other training.

The integration of career centers in higher education national accreditation instruments is the main background for the emergence of career centers. In addition, the increase in labor qualifications as the demands of the job market and the number of university graduates from year to year impact competition in obtaining job opportunities. So it is essential to facilitate students in career preparation through the career center. Identification of the internal and external environment becomes essential to do before setting up a program in an organization (Daft, 2010).

Input Aspect

Aspect The input aspect is evaluated on Management, Curriculum, Tutors, Students, Facilities and Infrastructure. Career center as an institution in Higher Education integrated into Student Affairs and Cooperation. The Career Center is under the coordination of Deputy Chair III for Student Affairs and Cooperation with the following organizational structure.

The career center organizational structure is a functional organizational structure. This organizational structure follows the conditions of Career Centers which are classified as small organizations in Higher Education with clear and definite targets. The results show that the proper organizational structure affects performance (Johari and Yahya, 2019; Nasution et al., 2021). The structure's Human Resources (HR) is HR in the Student Affairs and Cooperation Sector with adjacent main tasks and functions. All human resources in the career center are lecturers who carry out the tri dharma of higher education. Government Regulation of the Republic of Indonesia Number 37 of 2009 (Peraturan Pemerintah Republik Indonesia Nomor 37 Tahun 2009) states that the minimum workload of a lecturer is to carry out the tri dharma of higher education equivalent to...
12 (twelve) credits and a maximum of 16 (sixteen) credits in each semester following academic qualifications. But in reality, all lecturers who are managers of career centers have a performance burden that exceeds the maximum. Human resources with excessive workloads will cause saturation, impacting performance (Fajriani and Septiari, 2015).

Career centers do not have a competency-based curriculum as a guide for organizing educational and training activities. The career center only makes work programs that refer to students' needs in the work world. The work program is determined based on internal and external studies through tracer studies and users. Meanwhile, the implementation is left to professional institutions outside the career center that already have modules and professional tutors according to their competence. The competency-based curriculum is a curriculum concept that emphasizes the development and mastery of specified competencies (Arifin, 2015) so that a curriculum in a career center becomes very important in achieving competency standards.

Several programs in education and training are related to self-management, social management, career awareness, and career readiness. The implementation is in the form of self-introduction and development, leadership, communication, teamwork, interview techniques, and curriculum vitae preparation. In addition, Basic Life Support Training, Basic Trauma and Cardiac Life Support training for nursing students, and Japanese language training for students and graduates who are preparing for a career in Japan. Career center management also organizes career counseling, campus recruitment, job vacancies information, job fairs, and tracer studies as part of the work program.

Career counseling seeks to assist graduates in choosing a place of work. Career counseling seeks to linearize the desires of graduates and the needs of the world of work. Career guidance is given based on the student's personality type. This is an implication of Holland's theory which provides views and career directions according to interests and talents as well as views of the work environment (Wahyudi, Yusuf, and Afdal, 2021). Counseling is carried out by a professional counselor who is competent to assist graduates in providing information about the world of work they will pursue. The counselor referred to has a psychological education background and is also a permanent lecturer at a university. Career counseling services are opened scheduled two times a week with online registration. However, the utilization of career counseling is still very low.

The career center program is to assist students in preparing for their careers. Students are given additional competencies as a complement to their academics. All students are required in every career center program. However, in reality, not all students participate in the entire series of programs prepared by the career center. Students prefer to concentrate on completing academic programs. This condition is unfortunate because each program has been well designed by involving professional partners and is supported by complete facilities and infrastructure. Universities where the career center is sheltered, are very supportive by providing all access to facilities and infrastructure to ensure the goals of the career center are achieved optimally. Some programs even receive funding set out in the university's annual work plan and budget.

**Process Aspect**

Aspects of the process are evaluated on the agenda, implementation, and assessment of the career center program. Overall, the specified program has been implemented each semester. The career center management has scheduled each program implementation according to the academic calendar. Each training program is carried out face-to-face by involving partners who already have an education and training system according to competencies, including curriculum, professional and certified tutors. Assessment is given directly through pre-test and post-test to get a certificate of completion. Activity reports are well documented. Overall, career center education and training programs provide a positive value for students' self-development in preparing for their careers. However, the density of academic activities significantly affects the readiness of students to participate in the career center program. Some students expressed fatigue in participating in activities. Career center management needs to simplify the program without reducing the competencies needed by students to support their careers. Career center management needs to socialize the program since students are declared new during
the orientation period. This is to increase the understanding that educational value is not a guarantee and is not used enough in work. Additional competencies are complementary to being able to compete amid very tight competition. So that students are aware of being able to take part in training that provides increased competence.

Different conditions occur in programs other than education and training programs such as career counseling. Even though they are ready with good facilities, students are still reluctant to use them. Students' perception of career guidance is for problematic individuals. Then in the campus recruitment, the management of the career center still has difficulty getting partners in the world of work willing to carry out the recruitment process on campus, likewise with job fair activities. In addition to the low interest of partners in the health care industry, the management of career centers requires substantial funds to organize job fairs. So to overcome this, collaboration with several universities is needed to hold joint activities with a more extensive scope to have a better appeal.

Lastly is the tracer study program, a graduate tracer study conducted two years after graduation. Tracer's study aims to determine educational outcomes in the transition from the world of higher education to the world of work (Direktorat Jenderal Pendidikan Tinggi, 2012). Career center management uses standard instruments that the Government has prepared through the Directorate General of Higher Education to see the waiting period for work, the first job search process, the last job situation, and the application of competencies in the world of work. Tracer's study result is significant in showing the suitability of education both vertically and horizontally to the needs of the world of work. Career center management periodically reports the results of tracer studies on the Tracer Study website, Directorate General of Higher Education, Ministry of Education and Culture. Even though the respondents’ needs are met, they are still far from the number of graduates targeted in the tracer study. Most alumni are not willing to fill out questionnaires distributed online. Career center management needs to implement various strategies to increase the number of tracer study respondents. Dissemination online must be followed by other strategies such as holding alumni meetings, seminars, and other activities integrated into the graduate association organization.

Product Aspect

The product aspect is evaluated from the achievement of the career center program. As the main target in the career center program, students have increased competence, as evidenced by national competency certificates. The tracer study report shows that the waiting period to get their first job is not more than six months. The results also show the suitability of academic and non-academic learning processes in work. However, clinical skills still need to be improved. Tracer studies are beneficial for universities in evaluating the implementation and outcomes of education for the development and quality of education services (Indarta et al., 2022). Graduate users conveyed the same thing. Graduates who work in their healthcare facilities perform satisfactorily. Graduates have the knowledge and skills as needed. However, along with technological developments, it is expected that every graduate has mastery of information and communication technology and foreign language skills, especially English. In addition, graduates need to be more innovative and creative in the world of work. So it is necessary to apply a 21st-century learning model to achieve 4C skills, namely critical thinking, communication, collaboration, and creativity (Indarta et al., 2022). In the industrial revolution 4.0, everyone must have critical thinking skills, digital literacy knowledge and skills, media literacy, and a master of information and communication technology (Putriani and Hudaaidah, 2021).

Career center programs that have been designed and implemented generally provide good student benefits. Preparing student careers in the world of work is a solution to reduce cases of educated unemployment. However, it should be realized that the high number of educated graduates is not proportional to the number of job vacancies offered, especially job vacancies in health care facilities. So the career center program needs to consider the entrepreneurial program for students as one of the main achievements in career center management. So career center programs need to consider entrepreneurship education for students as one of the main achievements in career center management. Most of the research results show that being an entrepreneur is a
consciously planned behavior through entrepreneurship education based on the Theory of Planned Behavior which is taken from the psychological domain (Krueger, Reilly, and Carsrud, 2000). Entrepreneurship is a driver of economic growth and job creation (Wong, Ho, and Autio, 2005). Entrepreneurship is a means of empowering humans and organizations in creating social value for the public interest (Volkmann et al., 2009).

CONCLUSION

Career center management in health colleges positively influences preparing students’ careers from the start as new students until they are declared graduated in the academic process. Evaluation using the CIPP model shows that the Career Center Management has worked well. The Context Aspect shows that environmental analysis has been conducted as the background for establishing a career center with clear objectives. However, the career center management has not implemented strategic management properly. Input aspects are evaluated on Management, Curriculum, Tutors, Students, Facilities, and Infrastructure. In general, it looks good, but the shortcomings can be seen in the absence of a separate curriculum utilizing partners who already have a professional education and training system. Career center management only arranges various work programs according to the needs of the world of work but is not prepared with guidelines. The process aspect shows that all programs are carried out according to schedule. Partners appointed to implement the work program are professional partners competent to provide education and training with national certification. However, students cannot utilize all career center programs optimally, especially in career counseling and tracer study. Career center management also has difficulty finding partners in the world of work to fulfill campus recruitment programs and job fairs, which are also constrained by funding.

Furthermore, the product aspect shows reasonable student satisfaction, graduates, and graduate users. The additional competencies provided positively affect students’ readiness to face the world of work. However, the evaluation results show that the career center management needs to create programs that improve students’ ability to use information and communication technology and foreign language skills as needed. In addition, creating creative and innovative graduates needs to be developed in every program implementation. The results of the analysis also found that there was no entrepreneurship program in the career center management. This is very important considering that there is a mismatch between the number of jobs and the number of educated graduates. So that preparing students to become entrepreneurs in the health sector is a promising opportunity and prospect to answer the challenges of the world of work.

REFERENCES


DOI: https://doi.org/10.31004/basicedu.v6i5.3707


DOI: https://doi.org/10.31004/basicedu.v6i5.3707


